BUILDINGENERGY BOSTON

In the Last Analysis: An Electrified Town Garage for the 21st Century

Andrew Shapiro, Energy Balance

Curated by Fred Davis

Northeast Sustainable Energy Association (NESEA) | March 20, 2025

The Team

William Lamphere Architects

David Roy and John LaMothe





Engineering Services of Vermont, uc Dan Dupras and Patrick Perault



James Hoepker and Kevin Worden

Associates Commissioning

Mike LaCrosse and Walker Calderwood

Energy Balance, Inc. Andy Shapiro

What we will do today

- The building
- Options studied
- Energy analysis embodied and operational
- Construction costs
- Life cycle cost analysis
- Selected systems
- Design phase commissioning
- Lessons learned

Learning objectives

- Compare heating COP of
 - ground source open loop
 - ground source closed loop
 - air-to-water heat pumps
- Understand a simplified method to estimate closed loop ground source heat pump heating system over the course of a winter
- Understand the role of peak electrical demand in an all-electric building on system design and on operating cost
- Understand the multiple roles that radiant heat can play in a road maintenance garage







North elevation

Floorplan



- Sections · R-5 R-3
- R-50 PI roof
 - R-35 -- 4" rigid foil faced PI continuous +5.5" wood fiber batts
 - R-20+ Glavel + foam under slab
 - R-10 Thermal break at edges of slab
 - R-5 Tripane FG windows
 - R-15 3" foam overhead doors
 - 0.05 cfm50/sq.f.t shell





Options studied

Building enclosure

- Code metal
- high efficiency wood enclosure



Options studied

Mechanical systems

- Propane boiler
- Wood pellet boiler
- Air to water heat pump -(A2WHP)
- Ground source heat pump (GSHP)



All options with radiant floor

• Better melting/warming of trucks

- Heats incoming fresh air
- Large thermal flywheel

Baseline wood pellets

Baseline, Propane

High Performance, Wood pellets

High Performance, Propane

High Performance, Air to Water Heat Pump

High Performance, Ground Source Heat Pump

High Performance, Air to Water Heat Pump with PV

High Performance, Ground Source Heat Pump with PV

Baseline = metal building; High Performance = efficient wood building

Also looked at demand control for heat pump systems

Options studied

Demand controlled ventilation

- RH
- CO
- NO₂
- Manual
 Air heated
 by passing
 over radiant
 floor!





Peak electrical demand reduction – the dirty secret of electrification!

- Control EV chargers!
- Control heat pumps (?)
- 25,000 gallons of fire protection tanks for thermal



30F drop in tank temperature = 24 hrs of heat at -20F outside

storage

Analysis

- Embodied emissions
- Operational energy
- operational emissions
- construction costs
- operating expense
- 30 yr life cycle cost analysis

	EM Town Garage	Assumptions for Energy Modeling	240624			
	Building	Metal Building, per 2024 CBECS code	Efficient Wood Building			
	Windows	R-3.5	R-3.5			
	Skylights	none w/ 0.5 wsf lights	none w/ 0.5 wsf lights			
	Doors	R-2.7	R-2.7			
elope	Air/Vapor Barrier	Inner VB is inner skin of metal building panels	Full VB interior of walls, full VB on roof top, wall VE fully connected to roof VB			
Enve	Insulation Roof R-42, 6" foam insulated steel panels		R-60 / U=.0167			
	Insulation Walls	R-25, 4" foam insulated steel panels	R-30			
	Stem Wall	R-10 continuous rigid exterior	R-20 continuous rigid exterior insulation			
	Slab under	f-0.434 by code, but modeled at 0.71 for 2" under 48"	4" EPS under whole slab, R-18; f-0.2			
	Slab edge	none	4" exterior of stem wall, up 4 ft and down 4'			
	Overhead doors	R-6 no requirement	R-18			
	Air Leakage rate	0.25 cfm75/sf. Shell 6 sides, equivalent to 0.19 cfm50/sq.ft. shell 6 sides	0.06 cfm50/sq.ft. shell 6 sides			
	Envelope Commissioning	yes	yes			

	EM Town Garage		
		Metal Building, per 2024 CBECS code	Efficient Wood Building
	Ventilation	Two exhaust fans, controlled on CO, NO2, RH and	Two exhaust fans, controlled on CO, NO2, RH and
	Domestic Hot	Tank off boiler, full recirc	HPWH, EF =3.0, controlled circulation
	Controls	programmable thermostat	programmable thermostat
Mech	Heating	Propane or wood pellet boiler boiler, eff = 0.80, AFUE = 0.82	A2WHP COP 2.3; or GSHP COP 4.0; or propane or wood pellet boiler Eff=0.80 (HP COPs modeled dynamically)
	Cooling	office only, ASHP	office only, ASHP
	Lighting	LED	LED
	Plug Loads	Low	Low





Operating Energy and Cost Analysis Process

- 1. Takeoffs from building design
- 2. Inputs into Energy 10 to generate hourly loads (hourly simulation model)
- 3. Run model to output hourly loads for heat, hot water, lights, and other (no cooling in garage) and hourly outside temperature
- 4. Develop efficiency curve/equation for air to water heat pump (A2WHP) and for ground source heat pump (GSHP)
- 5. Apply heating efficiency equation to each hour's heating load

Wait – there's more!

Operating Energy and Cost Analysis Process

- 1. Takeoffs from building design
- Inputs into Energy 10 to generate hourly loads (hourly simulation model)
- 3. Run model to output hourly loads for heat, hot water, lights, and other (no cooling in garage) and hourly outside temperature
- 4. Develop efficiency curve/equation for air to water heat pump (A2WHP) and for ground source heat pump (GSHP)
- 5. Apply heating efficiency equation to each hour's heating load
- 6. Tally annual energy use by end use
- 7. Tally peak demand by month for whole building
- 8. For boilers, much simpler: apply efficiency of equipment (85%) to annual heating and hot water usage
- 9. Apply utility rate structure to monthly energy and peak demands
- 10. Apply emissions per unit energy to annual energy use

Hourly energy/load model output (8760 hours)

Heating "<u>load</u>" is how much energy is required to keep building warm Heating "<u>energy</u>" is how much electricity or fuel is required to supply that energy

For a heating <u>load</u> of 600 MMBtu/yr, with a heat pump with COP of 3, the <u>energy</u> required would be 200 MMBtu/yr of electricity. With a boiler with 80% efficiency, the <u>energy</u> required would be 750 MMBtu/year of propane

Outside							Heating
temp, F	Hour of		Bldg	DHW	Lighting	Plug	Load
dry bulb	the Year		kWh	kWh	kWh	kWh	kWh
	High perf	ormance		at COP=2			
	Total kWh		168,914	5,116	3,154	5,620	149,898
	Max	Max>>	68	1.0	0.6	1.0	64
34	1		32.8	0.29	0.09	0.38	32
33	2		30.3	0.29	0.09	0.38	29
35	3		29.3	0.29	0.09	0.38	28
34	4		28.9	0.29	0.09	0.38	28
29	5		31.2	0.29	0.09	0.38	30
27	6		33.5	0.29	0.09	0.38	32
26	7		34.7	0.29	0.08	0.38	34
26	8		35.1	0.29	0.08	0.48	34
25	9		34.8	0.38	0.08	0.48	33
25	10		33.4	0.38	0.08	0.48	32
25	11		33.3	0.38	0.08	0.48	32
27	12		31.5	0.38	0.08	0.48	30
26	13		30.4	0.38	0.08	0.48	29
25	14		31.6	0.38	0.08	0.48	30

Efficiency curves/equations Ground Source Heat Pump



Looking at this, why is an open loop system more efficient than closed loop?

060 - Performance Data cont.

Heating Capacity

So	urce	Load Flow-9 GPM					n 3	Load Flow-13.5 GPM					Load Flow-18 GPM							
EST °F	Flow GPM	ELT °F	LLT °F	HC MBTUH	Power kW	HE MBTUH	COP	LST *F	°F	HC MBTUH	Power kW	HE MBTUH	COP	LST °F	LLT °F	HC MBTUH	Power kW	HE MBTUH	COP	LST °F
		60		Alter and the second	10-10			11								distance of the second			· ·	11000
		80	1							0.4100.00	passas		a an							
	15.5	100	1							Opera	tion not	recomme	nded							
20		120	1																	
25		60	71,1	48.3	2,93	38.3	4.83	20.6	67,4	48.6	2.86	38.8	4.98	20.6	65.6	48.9	2.79	39.4	5.14	20.5
	100	80	90.8	47.3	3.93	33.9	3.53	21.1	87.3	47.6	3.85	34.4	3.62	21.1	85.5	47.8	3.76	35.0	3.72	21.0
	18	100	TIO.6	46.3	4.93	29.5	2.75	21.6	107.1	46.5	4.83	30.0	2.82	21.6	105.4	46.8	4.74	30.6	2.89	21.5
		120	130.4	45.3	5.93	25.1	2.24	22.1	126.9	45.5	5.82	25.6	2.29	22.1	125.2	45.7	5.71	26.2	2.35	22.0
		60	71.5	50.1	2.94	40.1	4,99	20.B	68.7	50.5	2.87	40,7	5,17	20.7	65.8	50.9	2,79	41.4	5.35	20.5
	~	80	91.3	49.3	3.95	35.9	3.66	21.8	88.5	49.7	3.86	36.5	3.77	21.6	85.7	50.0	3.77	37.1	3.89	21.5
	2	100	111.1	48.6	4.95	31.7	2.87	22.7	108.4	48.8	4.85	32.3	2.95	22.6	105.6	49.0	4.74	32.8	3.03	22.5
		120	131.0	47.B	5.96	27.5	2.35	23.7	128.2	48.0	5.84	28.0	2.41	23.6	125.5	48.1	5.72	28.6	2.46	23.5
		60	71.9	52.1	3.0	42.0	5.17	22.9	68.9	51.8	2.87	42.0	5,29	22.9	65,9	51.6	2.8	42.0	5.41	22.8
		80	91.7	50.9	4.0	37.4	3.77	23.7	88.7	50.8	3.86	37.6	3.86	23.6	85.8	50.7	3.8	37.8	3.95	23.5
50	13.5	100	111.4	49.7	5.0	32.8	2.94	24.4	108.6	49.8	4.84	33.2	3.01	24.3	105.7	49.8	4,7	33.7	3.08	24.3
		120	131.1	48.6	6.0	28.2	2.39	25.2	128.4	48.8	6.07	28.0	0.45	26.1	125.6	49.0	5.7	29.5	2.51	25.0
		60	72.4	54.1	2.97	44.0	574	25.0	69.2	53.2	2.88	43.3	5.41	25.0	66.0	52.2	2.79	42.7	5.48	25.1
	18	80	92.0	52.5	3.00	39.0	3.88	25.5	89.0	52.0	3.86	38.8	3.95	25.6	85.9	51.4	3.76	38.6	4.0	25.6
		100	111.7	50.5	4.96	34.0	3.01	26.1	108.7	50.8	4.84	34.2	3.07	26.1	105.8	50.6	4.72	34.5	3.14	26.1
_		120	174.5	49.3	5,95	29.0	2.43	26.7	128.5	49.6	5.82	29.7	2.50	26.6	125.7	49.8	5.69	30.4	2.56	26.5
	-	60	75.1	66.0	3.0	\$5.7	6.34	37.2	71.4	66.2	2.92	56.2	6.62	37.1	67.6	66.3	2.8	56,7	6.90	37.0
		80	94.6	63.9	4.0	50.2	4.66	38.5	91.0	64.1	3.89	50.8	4.83	38.4	87.4	64.3	3.8	51.4	4.99	38.2
		100	114.1	61.7	5.0	44.7	3.63	39.8	110.6	62.0	4.86	45.4	3.74	39.6	107.1	62.3	4.7	46.1	3.86	39,4
		120	133.7	59.6	6.0	39,3	2.93	41.0	130.3	60.0	5.83	40.1	3.02	40.8	126.9	60.3	5.7	40.9	3.11	40.6
		60	75.8	68.8	3.1	58.4	6.61	40.1	71.8	68.5	2.93	58.5	6.84	-40.1	67.8	68.2	2.8	58.5	7.09	40.0
	-	80	95.2	66.2	4.0	52.5	4.81	41.1	91.4	66.1	3.90	52.8	4.96	41.0	87.6	66.1	3.8	53.2	5.13	41.0
50	13.5	100	184.6	63.7	5.0	46.6	3.72	42.1	. 111.0	63.8	4.87	47.2	3.84	42.0	107.3	64.0	4.7	47.8	3.96	41.9
		120	134.0	61.1	6.0	40.6	2.98	43.1	130.5	61.5	5.85	41.5	3.08	42.9	127.1	61.9	5.7	42.4	3.18	42.8
		60	76.4	71.6	3.1	61.1	6.79	43.0	72.2	70.8	2.95	60.7	7.01	43.0	68.0	70.0	2.8	60.4	7.24	43,1
	10	80	95.7	68.6	4,1	54.7	4.93	43.7	91.7	68.2	3.92	54.8	5.09	43.7	87.8	67.8	3.8	54.9	5.25	43.7
	10	100	115.0	65.6	5.1	48.4	3.79	44.5	111.3	65.6	4.89	48.9	3.92	44.4	107.5	65.6	4.7	49.4	4.06	44.3
		120	134,3	62.6	6.0	42.0	3.03	45.2	130.8	63.0	5.87	43.0	3.15	45.1	127.3	63.4	5.7	44.0	3.26	45.0
		60	78.8	81.9	3.12	71.3	7.69	\$3.7	74.1	81.8	2.98	71.6	8.07	53.6	69.4	81.7	2.83	72.0	8.46	53.5
		80	98.0	78,4	4.06	015	5.65	55.2	93.5	78.5	3.92	65.1	5.88	55.1	89.0	78.6	3.78	65.7	0.10	54.9
	9	100	117.2	74.9	5.01	57.8	4.38	55.0	112.0	75.2	4.87	58.6	4.54	56.6	108.7	75.0	4.72	59.4	4.69	56.4
		120	136.4	71.4	5.95	51.1	3.52	58.3	132.3	72.0	5.81	52.1	3.63	58.1	128.3	72.5	5.67	53.1	3.75	57.8

<u>THIS</u> <u>TABLE IS</u> <u>NOT TO</u> <u>BE READ!</u>

Selected system: Ground Source Heat Pump System

Closed loop, boreholes



Open loop, "pump and dump"



Efficiency curves/equations Ground Source Heat Pump



Looking at this, why is an open loop system more efficient than closed loop?

Efficiency curves/equations Ground Source Heat Pump





Looking at this, why is an open loop system (more efficient than closed loop borehole)?

Efficiency curves/equations Air-to-Water Heat Pump



Apply heating efficiency equation to each hour's heating load And graph total building energy usage by hour



Energy and peak demand by month for whole building

Month	A2W HP	GSHP	A2W HP	GSHP	
	Building k	Wh/month	kW peal	k/month	
1	13,000	8,000	35	19	
2	13,000	8,000	35	19	
3	10,000	7,000	35	19	
4	5,000	4,000	17	11	
5	2,000	2,000	11	8	
6	2,000	2,000	9	7	
7	1,000	1,000	6	4	
8	1,000	1,000	8	6	
9	2,000	2,000	13	9	
10	4,000	3,000	14	10	
11	8,000	6,000	21	13	
12	11,000	8,000	32	17	
	72,000	52,000			

Operational energy 1st year

	Option	Energy Use [4]				
#	Name [2]	Electricity	Propane			
		kWh/year	Gal/year			
1	Prefab Metal, Propane Boiler	12,000	10,000			
2	Wood Frame, Propane Boiler	11,000	7,000			
3	Wood Frame, Air-to-Water Heat Pump	71,000	_			
4	Wood Frame, Ground Source Heat Pump	54,000	-			



Operational energy -- Uncertainty in Modeling

- EV chargers (not included in building analysis)
- Future equipment chargers
- Open 10X14 overhead doors
- Cold, iced trucks
- Infiltration rate over time

Energy cost by month for whole building

					No Demand Limit, no resistance heating			r	Demand limited, no resistance heating, at				
Month	A2W HP	GSHP	A2W HP	GSHP		A2W HP		GSHP	A2W HP			GSHP	
	Building k	Wh/month	kW peal	«/month		Cost/n	nont	th		Cost/r	ost/month		
1	13,000	8,000	35	19	\$	2,600	\$	1,500	\$	2,600	\$	1,500	
2	13,000	8,000	35	19	\$	2,600	\$	1,500	\$	2,600	\$	1,500	
3	10,000	7,000	35	19	\$	2,200	\$	1,400	\$	2,200	\$	1,400	
4	5,000	4,000	17	11	\$	1,500	\$	1,000	\$	1,100	\$	800	
5	2,000	2,000	11	8	\$	1,100	\$	700	\$	700	\$	500	
6	2,000	2,000	9	7	\$	1,100	\$	700	\$	700	\$	500	
7	1,000	1,000	6	4	\$	900	\$	600	\$	500	\$	400	
8	1,000	1,000	8	6	\$	900	\$	600	\$	500	\$	400	
9	2,000	2,000	13	9	\$	1,100	\$	700	\$	700	\$	500	
10	4,000	3,000	14	10	\$	1,300	\$	800	\$	1,000	\$	700	
11	8,000	6,000	21	13	\$	1,900	\$	1,300	\$	1,600	\$	1,100	
12	11,000	8,000	32	17	\$ 2,300 \$ 1,500		\$	2,300	\$	1,500			
	72,000	52,000			\$ 19,500 \$12,30		12,300	\$:	16,500	\$	10,800		

Energy cost	by month	for whol	e building
-------------	----------	----------	------------

					No Demano resistance	l Limit heati	, no ng	r	Demand li esistance	imit hea	ed, no ting, at				
Month	A2W HP	GSHP	A2W HP	GSHP	A2W HP	G	SHP	A	2W HP		GSHP	Α	2W HP		GSHP
	Building k	Wh/month	kW peak	x/month	Cost/m	nonth			Cost/r	non	th		Demand	char	ges <u>only</u>
1	13,000	8,000	35	19	\$ 2,600	\$	1,500	\$	2,600	\$	1,500	\$	731	\$	391
2	13,000	8,000	35	19	\$ 2,600	\$	1,500	\$	2,600	\$	1,500	\$	739	\$	391
3	10,000	7,000	35	19	\$ 2,200	\$	1,400	\$	2,200	\$	1,400	\$	738	\$	391
4	5,000	4,000	17	11	\$ 1,500	\$	1,000	\$	1,100	\$	800	\$	370	\$	235
5	2,000	2,000	11	8	\$ 1,100	\$	700	\$	700	\$	500	\$	370	\$	196
6	2,000	2,000	9	7	\$ 1,100	\$	700	\$	700	\$	500	\$	370	\$	196
7	1,000	1,000	6	4	\$ 900	\$	600	\$	500	\$	400	\$	370	\$	196
8	1,000	1,000	8	6	\$ 900	\$	600	\$	500	\$	400	\$	370	\$	196
9	2,000	2,000	13	9	\$ 1,100	\$	700	\$	700	\$	500	\$	370	\$	196
10	4,000	3,000	14	10	\$ 1,300	\$	800	\$	1,000	\$	700	\$	370	\$	209
11	8,000	6,000	21	13	\$ 1,900	\$	1,300	\$	1,600	\$	1,100	\$	443	\$	271
12	11,000	8,000	32	17	\$ 2,300	\$	1,500	\$	2,300	\$	1,500	\$	682	\$	362
	72,000	52,000			\$ 19,500	\$12	,300	\$:	16,500	\$	10,800	\$	5,900	\$	3,200

Match complexity of systems to owner's ability to manage it!

Gory details of WEC electricity rates

WEC	Large Pov	ver Rate							
\$	21.00	nonth							
\$	0.14	Per kWh	er kWh						
\$	35.87	monthly cha	nonthly charge						
WEC	Small Cor	nmercial Rate	9						
\$	0.23	Per kWh							
\$	29.89	monthly cha	rge						
\$	0.14	payment/kW	/h exported						
\$	0.12	lifetime cost	/kWh for PV e	electricity [5]					
Fuel	Costs								
\$	400	\$/ton pellets							
\$	2.00	\$/gallon propane							

Note that demand charges are ratcheted at 50%

[5] At \$2.50/Wp-DC installed cost,30 yr life, 0.5% degradation inoutput peryear



Energy emissions*



Basis of energy emissions

CO2e emission	ns per unit of	fuel					
	total lbs CO2	e/unit [2]					
Propane	16	lbs/gallon					
Electricity	0.9	ISO NE	Includes me	thane leakag	ge		
Electricity	0.2	WEC [4]					
Electricity, PV	0.11	from PV [3]					
[2] combustion Note that this	n emissions * is at the build	site/source fa ling meter. Th	actor + precor nis value does	nbustion emi not include d	ssions + comb combustion o	oustion em r heat pum	iission ip

efficiencies	or distribution	efficiency v	within the	building
				U U

[3] includes energy to produce and install PV system		
[4] estimated value based on WEC selling class 1 RECs		
and buying RECs frome existing old hydro, and		
landfill embodied emissions		

Construction costs

Option		Construction Cost [3]			
#	Name [2]	Without Soft			
			Costs	Wi	th soft costs
1	Prefab Metal, Propane Boiler	\$	3,910,000	\$	4,720,000
2	Wood Frame, Propane Boiler	\$	4,050,000	\$	4,860,000
3	Wood Frame, Air-to-Water Heat Pump	\$	4,040,000	\$	4,850,000
4	Wood Frame, Ground Source Heat Pump	\$	4,350,000	\$	5,160,000

\$4,654,000 **4** as of 37/25

30 yr life cycle cost analysis

BLCC 5.3-24 -- Building Life-Cycle Cost software from Applied Economics Office, Engineering Laboratory, National Institute of Standards and Technology

- Discount (3%) and Escalation Rates (2.3%) are NOMINAL (inclusive of general inflation)
- Replacement costs included for HPs (20 years), circulators (15 years) boilers (20 years), controls (20 years), HP compressor repair and boiler repair (10 years)
- Annual repair and maintenance costs, based on similar systems
- Run for 30 years -- 50 year life for wells and piping, etc., so residual value at end
- Residual building value at 30 years is estimated at 75% of initial construction cost.

Run by Dan Dupras, PE, Engineering Services of Vermont

30 yr life cycle cost analysis

Option		Life Cycle		
		Operating Cost [5]		
			\$\$\$	
1	Prefab Metal, Propane Boiler	\$	2,955,000	
2	Wood Frame, Propane Boiler	\$	2,916,000	
3	Wood Frame, Air-to-Water Heat Pump	\$	2,953,000	
4	Wood Frame, Ground Source Heat Pump	\$	2,923,000	

Probably gone Federal Incentives:

- \$244,000 for ground source system
- \$48,000 for Air-to-water HP
- \$37,500 for smaller 50 kW array
- Feds make direct payment to Town. Efficiency VT incentives not included

[5] Not including incentives, not including enclosure maintenance

Note that these costs are all very close to the same -- within the margins of error!

Probably gone Federal Incentives

Probably gone Federal Incentives:

- \$244,000 for ground source system
- \$48,000 for Air-to-water HP
- \$37,500 for smaller 50 kW array
- Feds make direct payment to Town. Efficiency VT incentives not included

Selected system: Ground Source Heat Pump System

Closed loop, boreholes



Open loop, "pump and dump"



Selected system: Ground Source Heat Pump System

Closed loop, boreholes



Open loop, "pump and dump"

Drilled test well with hydro-geologist advice and found 90 gallons per minute. Open loop!

	HP only COP	Total COP
GSHP, open loop	4.9	3.9
GSHP closed loop	4.2	3.6
A2WHP	2.7	2.6

Constant over years

COP decreases as earth cools with unbalanced heat/cool loads Constant over years



Ground Source Heat Pump System

Commissioning

Cx Associates and A. Shapiro detailed review of MEP and Enclosure

Two formal reviews:

- Design Development
- Construction Document stage

Cx Associates on-site inspection and testing

- MEP systems
- Enclosure inspection, "first instance" testing with fog, IR and blower door; final compliance testing (0.05 cfm50/sq.f.t. shell 6 sides)





Lessons learned

- Prepare for peak demand early!
 - Don't forget EV chargers
- Bang down pumping loads!
- Handle big wild card loads -- frozen trucks and big open doors – without increasing peak demand
- Value of commissioning

Thank you!